A Milder Colonization: 
Jewish Expansion to the New World, 
and the New World in the 
Jewish Consciousness 
of the Early Modern Era

Paolo Bernardini

It is both an honor and a pleasure to write the introductory pages to a book that includes essays written by the major international specialists in the field. In the following pages I attempt to offer the reader a frame of reference for entering the fascinating and complex worlds examined in these essays. Every one of them offers an uncommon perspective and is the result of a major scholarly effort. This volume provides not only a broad overview of the complex encounter(s) between a European ethnic and religious minority and an entire continent newly “discovered” and immediately colonized, but also enlightens us with single, seemingly minor episodes that took place in the shadow of this major encounter. These essays—written by specialists in economic, social, political, and Jewish history, as well as in anthropology and geography—tell a story that has been scarcely told thus far, at least in its entirety. Since the time of the conquest, the Jewish presence in the Americas—North, South, and the Caribbean, as dealt with extensively in this volume—has been extremely meaningful. It is not an exaggeration—as will become clear by reading these essays—to state that Jews, both real Jews and crypto-Jews, marranos and conversos, have contributed deeply to the shaping of the political, social, and economic patterns of the New World. The contrary will also prove to be true; the New World has deeply influenced the destiny, as well as the character, of the Jewish “Nation,” especially in liberal North America, but also in Central and South America and in the Caribbean islands.
The terminus ante quem of the essays presented in this book is set by the revolutions for independence in South America, in the early decades of the nineteenth century. For this reason, the most important chapter in the socioeconomic and demographic history of the American diaspora—the migration flood in the last decades of the nineteenth and the early decades of the twentieth centuries—is not touched upon. The book deals with the very first encounters, the first “colonization” by European Jews in the New World. For the most part these were Jews who were free to profess their own faith in the British and Dutch Americas, to a certain degree also in French America, and crypto-Jews, marranos, and Cristãos novos in Spanish and Portuguese America.

The “Jew” Christopher Columbus

Jewish involvement in the discovery and “conquest” of America begins as early as Columbus’s enterprise. His daring esprit, his constant uneasiness with the Catholic establishment, and his twofold if cunning dealings with the highest political authorities of his time has turned Cristoforo Colombo, in the eyes of historians and writers, into a quasi-archetypal embodiment of the Renaissance taste for free, individual inquiry, intellectual freedom, and skepticism. Notwithstanding his personal uncertainties, actual difficulties, and greed, he cherished for a long time a dream that was eventually to be realized, even though in the end it turned out to be a felix error, for he aimed at opening up a new route west to reach the East Indies.

In a certain sense, Columbus was the first American, long before any white person settled in the vast if untamed landscapes of the Western Hemisphere. Not surprisingly, his quite extensive if utilitarian knowledge of contemporary sciences, as far as they were relevant to his enterprise—astronomy, geography, navigation—combined with his taste for action and adventure, lead some historians today to identify him as a perfect Renaissance man. Moreover, he faced the destiny of being identified as a Jew, or, at least, as a descendant of an Italian Jewish family only recently converted to Christianity. Undoubtedly, the “Jewish” factor in Columbus’s personality is almost one with his peculiar Renaissance character: individualism, skepticism, willingness to challenge the powers that be while at the same time pleasing them.

The historiographical assumption about the Jewishness of Columbus and his family—from Hermann Kellenbenz in the late nineteenth century to Sarah Leibovici in the 1980s, and including Salvador de Madariaga—has been fiercely attacked by historians, on the grounds of substantial, if incomplete, documentary evidence to the contrary. Columbus does incarnate, however, a kind of adventurous and learned man, who challenges the established authorities, both political and intellectual, to reach into the unknown. If not a Jew, he was certainly a man of the Renaissance,
as much as Lorenzo de Medici, Leonardo da Vinci, and Michelangelo, all of whom dared to venture where others would or could not.

Although Columbus’s “Jewishness” can be questioned and regarded as a myth, the very fact that the question is raised is worthy of reflection. The Renaissance, in its “spirit of initiative”—to paraphrase Felipe Fernández-Armesto—owes something to the Jewish spirit of inquiry and “skepticism.” The most daring scientists and philosophers of the Renaissance, such as Marsilio Ficino and Pico, were decisively influenced by Jewish mysticism, and scholars are beginning just now to understand and reappraise the role of Kabbalah, prominent and so far neglected, in late Renaissance authors, such as Giordano Bruno. This is probably only the beginning of what is bound to become a major reassessment of Christian Renaissance thought.

An Old New World: Biblical Geography and the Impact of the New World on the Old

The idea of a “new world” was difficult to understand, even in the Renaissance. Time and space were somehow intertwined, leaving little or no room for novelty. The world was conceived of, according to a Classical paradigm, as getting older and older with the course of time. New beginnings in either space or time were not considered. According to the authority principle, to the unchallenged voice of the auctoritates—whether Jewish, Greek, or Latin—new lands had to be identified with those lands belonging to Classical geography. As is well known, Columbus himself set off to discover a new route to the Indies and never realized that he had in fact discovered a route to altogether new lands. The authority of the texts was rarely attacked, even in the intellectually daring context of the Renaissance, as Professor Anthony Grafton has brilliantly demonstrated. Thus, Columbus well epitomizes the spirit of his time. Daring, but not daring enough even to understand the full potential of his discoveries, the full meaning of the fruits of his spirit of initiative.

The first section of the present collection of essays deals with this set of problems. It offers the reader a prehistory of Jewish settlement in the New World. At the same time, this first part provides a wide intellectual framework, which will prove useful to better understand and assess the future role of the Jewish factor in the colonization of the New World, as well as the multiple relationships (social, economic, religious, intellectual) between Old and New World.

James Romm, an expert on the geography of the “extremes,” provides, in the opening essay, a learned and revealing reading of Columbus’s and his contemporaries’ geography, as it was related to biblical and Classical scholarship and sources. As was common in European biblical interpretation—at least until the time of Richard Simon, who began the tradition of critical and philological interpretation of the Scripture in the
second half of the seventeenth century—Columbus and his contemporaries treated the Bible as a unique and unchallengeable source of knowledge. Biblical geography offered not only names but even “clear” coordinates to locate places. When he landed on Hispaniola’s wild shores, Columbus thought he had landed on Ophir, the mythical shore of King Solomon’s travels (Gen. 1: 29, but especially I Kings 9: 28). Unfortunately, deeper readings of the Bible demonstrated that those geographical coordinates were far from precise—they were even vague and contradictory. It was therefore empirical investigation, along with more accurate readings of the text, that helped establish a better identification and naming of the known and unknown worlds after Columbus’s path-breaking voyages.

Cosmography and the art of mapmaking acquired, slowly but definitively, the status of science. The process of undermining the ancient authorities had just begun, but the weight of those millennial authorities remained heavy nonetheless. Even the boldest freethinkers, anarchists of philosophy and philology such as Guillaume Postel and Isaac La Peyrère, had to come to terms with those auctoritates, and all their works seem entangled in this never-ending, potentially devastating confrontation. For even after the novelty of geography was eventually established and conventionally accepted, what about the ethnography? Where did those bizarre peoples come from? In what way did their existence confirm, or deny, the prophetic books of the Old Testament and the Second Coming announced by the prophet Daniel? Could we convert them all to Christianity, in order to fulfill the prophecies and make the Second Coming come faster?

James Romm’s essay raises questions that are historically fundamental, the answers to some of which can be found in David S. Katz’s and Benjamin Schmidt’s essays, the first devoted to the “wandering of the lost ten tribes in America” from Menasseh ben Israel to present-day millennialism, and the second to “Menasseh ben Israel and the Dutch Idea of America.” Here, biblical geography and ethnography—the myth of the Lost Ten Tribes—become matters of religious enthusiasm and political concern. In the seventeenth century, an era obsessed and fractured by religious fanaticism, millennialism, and judeophobia, Menasseh ben Israel made good use of the argument that the Lost Ten Tribes could be identified with the Native Americans—as support for the cause of the readmission of the Jews into England, a goal that he partially achieved.

Benjamin Schmidt offers, in a highly informative essay, an original interpretation of America in Dutch history, politics, arts, and imagination during Menasseh ben Israel’s time. Schmidt places Menasseh in the context of contemporary Dutch culture and Dutch proto-Americanism. The idea of applying a “Dutch republican dimension” to the “Sephardi profile” proves to be fertile and heuristically groundbreaking. In the early modern Jewish vision of the New World, the “republican,” “freedom” factor plays a fundamental role, along with millennialism and other
peculiar adaptations of the “revelation” of the New World to particular, politically oriented visions and aims. What Schmidt says about Menasseh could be applied to other outstanding figures of the contemporary Sephardi community of Amsterdam, including the fascinating baroque poet Miguel Levi de Barrios (1635–1701), who traveled to Tobago in his youth and constantly kept the image of the New World in his poetic mind while at the same time praising Dutch republicanism and independence.

David S. Katz, the major international authority on Anglo-Jewish history, and the author of a fundamental book about the “readmission” of the Jews into England under Cromwell—where the role played by Menasseh ben Israel in this context is somewhat reduced—offers a daring perspective on the offspring of millennial thought, from Menasseh to the contemporary fanatical sects haunting the United States and, to a lesser degree, Europe. Menasseh’s *Hope of Israel* (*Mikveigh Yisrael*), in which millennialism plays a positive role in presenting the Jews in the most favorable light, in the Old as well as the New World, turns into an ill-fated, ill-starred nightmare when the Bible undergoes misleading, distorted interpretations by fanatical sects, rabble-rousers, anti-Semitic groups, and pseudo-pagan cults, such as the notorious “Children of Satan.” Katz carefully describes four centuries of evolution/involution of millennial thought, showing how biblical exegesis, especially the exegesis of the prophetic books, is far from being a dead letter or just a matter for academic disputes.

The other two essays in the first part of the volume are concerned with what we could label the “view from within.” Patricia Seed’s and Noah J. Efron’s essays offer a view of Jewish “technical contributions” to the discovery of the New World and of Jewish views and interpretations of America in the early modern era, respectively.

Patricia Seed, the author of an acute volume on the symbolic European “conquest” of the Americas, offers a brief overview of the “Jewish” cosmography and sailing technology behind Columbus’s and Vasco da Gama’s enterprises. Without the first mariner’s astrolabe, assembled by the Jewish astronomer Abraham Zacuto, who presented it personally to Vasco da Gama in 1497, not only da Gama’s voyages but also subsequent travels to America would have been much more problematic.

Noah Efron’s essay illuminates an area fairly neglected by previous scholarship. He analyzes the ways in which Jewish scholars, writing mainly in Hebrew and thus aiming at a Jewish public, understood and interpreted the discovery of the New World. The overall picture we get is more shaded and differentiated than that we can draw from contemporary non-Jewish authors. Millennial and apocalyptic veins are present, as well as the identification of the New World with the biblical Ophir, especially in Azariah de‘ Rossi and David Gans, but there are other, peculiarly Jewish, aspects that are not to be found in Christian authors. Often Jewish geographers and scientists saw in the New World an unexpected resource for their hopes of a better life, more or less theologically or
eschatologically founded. They perceived that the discoveries meant that the world was changing. For a people oppressed from time immemorial, a New World implied a new set of expectations, possibly a way out from disgrace and suffering. In this, the Jews were no less fascinated by the New World than other European minorities. In fact, they often anticipated and occasionally cherished an American, the American, dream. Like contemporary Christian scholars, Jewish geographers and historians tended toward a utilitarian, often parochial, vision of the New World. As Efron brilliantly demonstrates, Jewish understanding of the New World was closely related to Jews’ understanding of their own biblical past as well as their dire contemporary plight. “Pure” science—interest in the natural world for its own sake—was hard to be found at that time, even in contemporary Christian thought. Erasmian utilitas and scriptural evidence were the keywords in humanist interpretation and in Renaissance thought in general. Efron’s essay contributes in a special way to the long overdue rediscovery and reappraisal of Jewish science—in its positive, open-minded, and reciprocal relationships with gentile science—throughout the early modern period. This relationship has brilliantly emerged in recent scholarship, notably in the path-breaking works of André Neher, David B. Ruderman, and Raphael Patai, among others.

The Question of Identity: Marranos, New Christians, Conversos in Spanish and Portuguese America

While the first section of the volume addresses questions pertaining to intellectual history, the history of science, and theology, the second section approaches themes belonging more properly to socio-anthropological history. Whereas in British, Dutch, and to some extent French America the Jews could openly profess their faith, protected by toleration and, after the War of Independence, granted the full rights of citizens by the American constitution, the Jews in Spanish and Portuguese America had to conceal their identity. Their legal status and social condition mirrored exactly that present in the Iberian Peninsula after 1492 (for Spain) and 1497 (for Portugal). The Jewish migration to what we now call “Latin America” should be renamed, more precisely, the “New Christian migration.” The fact that the New Christians in Latin America in the colonial era by far outnumbered the “daylight” Jews in North America makes the treatment of New Christian identity almost compulsory in this book. Before analyzing the prominent role that New Christians played in American society and economy, it is necessary to investigate who they in fact were, and how they represented themselves—or more often, were represented—by external sources (the Spanish civil and ecclesiastical authorities, the surrounding society).

Threatened by the Inquisition—“tribunal de los infiernos,” according to a contemporary marrano poet, Antonio Enríquez Gómez (ca. 1600–63)—
and regularly surrounded by the hostility of the "pure blood" population, the New Christians in the New World often succeeded, nonetheless, in securing for themselves a stable position and a sound income by engaging in trade with Europe and North America, and by coming to terms with the hostile social and natural environment.

Robert Rowland, an international expert in historical demography and early modern social European history, provides in his essay the methodological coordinates needed to identify, as well as to further analyze, the phenomenon of "marranism" and the figure of the marrano in the Iberian Peninsula before and after the expulsion of 1492. Rowland, partially accepting I. S. Revah’s seminal definition of marrano religion as a "religion of will," describes the complex shape taken by Judaism in the practices and self-understanding of the New Christians. Marrano Judaism was primarily a religion constructed according to remembrance, to recollection, even to the image and understanding of it held and propagated by the Inquisition itself, occasionally labeled by historiography and New Christian popular opinion alike as a \textit{fábrica de judeus}.

Referring to the Iberian Peninsula, Rowland deals with the key problem of "dual identity" (Catholic in the external world, Jewish in the secrecy of home and in familial networks) that characterized marranos well before the expulsion of the Jews from Spain in 1492 or their forced, even tragicomic, conversion in Portugal in 1497. Marrano identity thus becomes a sort of schizophrenia, although neither Rowland nor Nathan Wachtel in the following essay arrives at this extreme conclusion. The social and intimate conflicts that shaped marrano identity and conscience in the Old World were reproduced, with subtle differences, in the New World when the Inquisition was reproduced there with all its power, which was diminished only by the vastness of the territory. Marranism has certainly been a developing rather than a static faith. Even well-rounded faiths, such as Catholicism and Judaism, often unthreatened by social forces and much easier to grasp and define, were far from being frozen in the early modern era. Both were affected by reformatory streams, Protestantism in the first case, and Karaitism, Sabbateanism, Hassidism, Frankism, and other heresies in the other. Catholicism and Judaism underwent, at a theological and a social-individual level, major changes from 1400 onward.

Finally, Rowland correctly emphasizes the primary role played by Portuguese New Christians, both in Spain—to which they emigrated massively after 1580, the year of the union of the Spanish and Portuguese crowns—and in the New World. Their impact was felt not only in Brazil, of course, but also in the Spanish dominions, where they maintained for a long time a key role in trade.

Nathan Wachtel’s essay should be read in close conjunction with Rowland’s. Wachtel, whose most recent work, written together with Lucette Valensi, has shed a new, keen light on Judaism, memory, and identity in modern and contemporary Europe, widens Rowland’s concept of
“dual identity” to encompass the cognate one of “dual sincerity.” Wachtel’s unsurpassed knowledge of Andean historical anthropology guides his masterly reconstruction, on the basis of selected cases, of marrano religious practices and beliefs in the seventeenth century. He demonstrates the complex syncretism of marrano religiosity—well exemplified by the awkward cult of “Saint” Moses—and the ways in which contemporary identity mingled with memories of the past (original Judaism) and messianic and political expectations (as in the hopes that arose among Portuguese New Christians, at home and in Hispanic America, regarding the reconquered independence of Portugal in 1640). The way in which marranismo slowly lost its religious meaning and helped to bring about, in a certain sense, through memory and recollection, the reconstruction of a Jewish national identity is particularly interesting. Both Rowland’s and Wachtel’s essays invite a closer, serial as well as analytical investigation of marrano religiosity using the huge and invaluable sources of Inquisitorial trials and other external records. It is in the spirit of this book not only to offer a vast amount of new historical evidence and interpretation, but also to stimulate new research in uncommon directions and from original perspectives.

Solange Alberro's essay is based on her previous, extensive research on the Inquisition in New Spain. Alberro describes the complex and fascinating ways in which the New Christians reconstructed and changed their own social and religious identity in Mexico during the seventeenth century. Outwardly acting as Spanish Christians—even singing the poems of Lope de Vega, an author who was certainly not a philosemitic—they practiced their own version of Judaism at home. Alberro’s essay illuminates the twofold interaction between New Christians and the Inquisition in New Spain. Belonging to the same social elite, Inquisition officers and New Christians to a certain extent shared a range of values; they even had reciprocal social intercourse on a friendly basis. Crypto-Judaism often could be so cryptic as to escape even the keen eyes of the Inquisition. The New Christian community in New Spain proved hard to destroy, and the Inquisition was frequently too weak to destroy crypto-Judaism.

After 1640, however, the situation changed for the worse. The newly reacquired independence of Portugal, after sixty years of Spanish domination, helped to create a web of suspicion in the Spanish American empire against the New Christians, most of whom were of Portuguese descent (at a certain point “Portuguese” became another name for Jew, along with marranos and conversos). The New Christians were accused of being part of the complicidad granda (“Great Plot”) to subvert the Spanish crown. From the point of view of the history of political thought, this is one of the first appearances of the conspiracy theory on a vast scale, long before Augustin Barruel (1741–1820) assigned it a firm status in political thought. The persecutions of the 1640s accelerated the process of assimilation of the New Christians, at the same time enlarging the gap between New Christian social layers, and, paradoxically, bringing about the
decline of the Inquisition itself, due to the dissolution of its major targets. Alberro’s essay shows how the Inquisition followed a political formula, the creation of Sozialdisziplinierung (social discipline)—according to Otto Brunner’s seminal definition—which was its main task in Europe (including Italy, as has been recently demonstrated by Adriano Prosperi).

Eva Alexandra Uchmany, the author of a lavishly illustrated and highly informative book on the New Christians in Spanish America, offers in her essay a narrative description of the New Christians’ and crypto-Jews’ involvement in the colonization of Spanish America from the early sixteenth century until 1660. Uchmany’s essay closes with an overview of the development of the New Christian community from 1660 to the late eighteenth century, almost on the eve of the Wars of Independence that freed Latin America from Iberian rule. Her approach, encompassing political, social, religious, and economic history, is most useful for understanding particular phases and aspects of New Christian history as they are dealt with in the essays that follow. Uchmany draws a distinction between the New Christians of Spanish and of Portuguese origins—to help us better identify the changes that affected the marrano presence in the New World—while analyzing in detail some peculiar, individual personalities. The profile and destiny of those New Christians belonging to economic and social elites is particularly striking. While they constituted an upwardly mobile social cluster, because of their (concealed) faith they were at the same time subject to constant fear, blackmail, and pressure exerted by authorities as well as by the surrounding community. Their future was often doomed, and their lives uneasy. Uchmany’s views of the New Christian experience in Spanish America is less positive than that offered by Alberro. At the same time, the two perspectives can—if carefully read and understood—co-exist.

The last essay in this section of the book, by Günter Böhm, deals with the experience, in the long term, of the crypto-Jews and conversos in colonial Peru and Chile. Professor Böhm, a leading authority on this subject and a follower of the masterly scholarly tradition inaugurated by José Toribio Medina, offers a brief account of the problem of historical sources for the study of the New Christians in Chile. At the same time, through some individual examples as well as a serial overview of the Inquisitorial trials, Böhm demonstrates how the evolution of marranism in Chile paralleled the trend throughout Spanish America, with an increased number of trials in the 1630s and 1640s during the time of the “Great Plot.” That New Christians did not emigrate to Chile before a comparatively rich economy had emerged bears a certain typicality. New Christians and crypto-Jews tended to migrate where the economy was already flourishing, or where at least it showed promise of growth. New Christians and Jews alike were rarely pioneers in wastelands, where everything, including trade and markets, had to be built. This fact differentiates those minorities from other religious sects—such as Quakers, Mormons, and Hutterites in North America—endowed with a more
“pioneering” spirit and more able to start in an undeveloped land the primary economic activity needed to make it grow: agriculture.

The Jews in Portuguese America

Anita Novinsky, a well-known expert on Brazilian-Jewish history, discloses a new chapter in the history of the New Christian community in Brazil. Focusing on a relatively late time period, the first half of the eighteenth century—a time of decline for the New Christians in Spanish America—Novinsky offers a detailed view, based on extensive archival research, of the marranos in the vast Brazilian region of Minas Gerais. The results of this case study show interesting differences between the New Christian experience in Spanish America and that in Portuguese America. In the latter, for instance, a still vigorous New Christian community proved to be more daring in colonization and participated, along with some 300,000 Portuguese, in the rush for gold that exploded at the beginning of the eighteenth century. Novinsky’s essay casts new light also upon the process of secularization undergone by the New Christians in the first half of the eighteenth century, which can be fruitfully compared with the same occurrence in Europe among professing Jews. Skepticism—not as a philosophy but as a way of life—and agnosticism became common among the Minas Gerais New Christians in this period.

Novinsky discerningly discusses both current and classical (Max Weber) interpretations of the social and economic meaning of religion. Of particular interest is the assumption, shared by some contemporary historians, including Novinsky herself, that the introduction of the Inquisition in Portugal was “a reaction to European economic growth, namely, the development of a competitive and upwardly mobile mercantile middle class, which inserted itself into the spheres of power, thereby threatening the aristocracy’s political and financial hegemony.” Can this theory be applied to Brazil as well? In her brilliant and massively documented essay, Novinsky addresses this fundamental question. The competition between New and Old Christians in Brazilian markets seems to have offered the latter a comparative advantage over the former, in that New Christians could be accused of crypto-Judaism, which had the effect of diminishing their economic power. Religion and economy play, in this context, a role even subtler than that conferred on them in Max Weber’s or Werner Sombart’s classical analyses. Finally, the process of secularization led the New Christians slowly to attach to Judaism not a religious but an ideological, “national” meaning. From this perspective, Novinsky’s conclusions seem to coincide with the interpretation of marranism put forward by Nathan Wachtel in his essay.

Geraldo Pieroni’s essay deals with the prehistory of New Christian settlement in Brazil, namely the banishment of New Christians from Portugal to Brazil, and is mainly derived from his in-depth analysis of the
The New Christians in French America

The fourth section of this book deals with a subject that has so far received very little scholarly attention: the history of the Jews and the New Christians in the French colonies in the Americas. Gérard Nahon, a leading authority on Sephardi and French-Jewish history, offers a precise overview of the “American dimension” of the Jews in Bayonne. Contrary to Bordeaux, which has been studied in depth, Bayonne, a relatively minor harbor on the French Atlantic coast, has been generally neglected by scholars, at least with relation to its Portuguese Jewish community. The Portuguese Jews of Bayonne, whose religious identity (Jews? New Christians?) was socially and legally unclear until the French Revolution, played an important role in commerce with the Americas. As so often happens—and Fernand Braudel has once and for all demonstrated—trade at the same time implied and fostered cultural exchanges. This is true not only at the level of elite culture—and the case of Daniel Lopez Laguna, the author of a splendid translation of the Psalms into Spanish (1720), seems quite isolated—but especially at the level of cultural practices and imagination. Bayonne Jews cherished a certain kind of “American dream” which “pervaded conversations and thoughts”; as Nahon presents it, they “interiorized” American spaces in a peculiar way. Some of them once again brought credibility to the myth that the Lost Ten Tribes were located in America. Nahon, focusing mainly on the eighteenth century, solidly demonstrates how the American dimension was also instrumental in enabling Bayonne Jews to strengthen their own socioeconomic position in France. This fact can be confirmed by the substantial weight carried by the French Atlantic Jewish community during the French Revolution.

Silvia Marzagalli brings a new and fresh perspective to one of the most studied among the Jewish communities in France: that of Bordeaux. Focusing once again on the eighteenth century—when Bordeaux rose to national prominence as a port of trade—Marzagalli analyzes the commercial and familial réseaux that gave to the Sephardi merchants of Bordeaux

phenomenon presented initially in his doctoral dissertation. Pieroni gives a substantial account of Portuguese trials and the subsequent exile to America. He shows how this form of punishment fit into the legal and theological schemes of the Inquisition and was conceived of as a kind of “purgatory” to prepare for full conversion to Christianity and the return home. It was a purgatory that turned into hell for many, but also into a paradise for quite a few, who decided not to return home and to settle in the bountiful New World. Pieroni’s essay is in conformity with the most recent European historiography about the Inquisition, which includes such works as Francisco Bethencourt’s pioneering research on European Inquisitions in comparative perspective.
a comparative advantage in Atlantic colonial trade. By using Zvi Loker’s argument to identify this advantage that the Jews possessed in comparison to non-Jewish merchants—namely, “family networks,” “higher geographical mobility,” and “knowledge of foreign languages”—Marzagalli sketches out a line of continuity and evolution in the economic history of the Bordeaux Jews. She demonstrates that the comparative advantage was to be found especially in the “tertiary” sectors of the economy: banking and insurance. She also most appropriately regards political and social history as deeply intertwined, while presenting some notable examples of Jewish mercantile families. Marzagalli takes into account both the direct and the indirect (investments, finance, insurance) participation of Jewish merchants in the Atlantic trade. Her conclusion goes against any typicality in the Bordeaux case. On the basis of the evidence, and for a variety of historical reasons, the case of Bordeaux appears to be unique. Only some comparisons can be made—though merely in quantitative terms—with the Jewish merchants of Bayonne, studied by Nahon.

Mordechai Arbell provides, in his long and detailed study, a most useful mapping of the social, legal, and political conditions of the Jews in the French Caribbean colonies. Arbell shows how the conditions under which the Jews lived were altered by the passage from the overtly tolerant regime of the Dutch to French rule. The legal entitlements of the Jews became unclear and shifting, and the restrictive power of the Catholic Church often overwhelming. Arbell clearly describes the various economic activities practiced by the Jews in the Caribbean area, especially sugar production and trade. He also stresses the political weight of the coalition of Jesuits and French planters—how a mix of social envy and religious hatred blended and resulted in the expulsion of the Jews from Guadeloupe and Martinique. The relationship between the political events in France and those occurring in the colonies is of particular interest. Often, policy toward the Jews in the French Caribbean mirrored and followed developments at home; occasionally, it went its own way. The situation in Haiti is of particular interest, especially after the revolution, when a large number of Jews married freed slaves, gradually constituting the Haitian middle class—a phenomenon not easily found elsewhere.

A gem of scholarship, John Garrigus’s essay addresses the complex question of citizenship in Saint-Domingue in the quarter-century preceding the French Revolution. The flow of racial, geopolitical, and religious ideas from France into the colonies—from Montesquieu to Buffon and Grégoire, from the Enlightenment to revolutionary ideology—is analyzed here with a particular reference to the evolution, in terms of social standing and legal status, of all the social and ethnic components of colonial Saint-Domingue: Jews, free people of color, French whites. The first lines of the essay—which somewhat epitomize its main points—are worth quoting in full:
The case of Saint-Domingue’s Sephardim illustrates that the story of the Jews in Europe’s expansion westward is about more than the survival or mutation of deeply rooted family traditions. Old World questions about Jewish political identity did not disappear in the Americas. Rather, these persistent issues forced colonists and their children born in the New World to reconcile new European philosophies with American conditions. In the case of the largest slave colony in the Caribbean, Saint-Domingue’s Jews helped translate emerging French nationalism into an attack on racial prejudice that eventually produced the Haitian Revolution. By raising complex issues of national identity and citizenship in French America after 1763, Sephardic merchants and planters provided a model for another group whose place in colonial society was equally ambiguous: Saint-Domingue’s free people of color.

Garrigus’s essay sets methodological guidelines that can be fruitfully applied to other situations, such as those of the Jews in Dutch and British America. Legal status, social aspirations, and economic positions interact in this analysis, and it appears clearly that a precise picture of the New Christian plight cannot be gained without simultaneously taking into account all of these factors. Saint-Domingue became the playground for ill-fated attempts at racial integration and for the formation of a “New White” elite with racial (and not necessarily religious) connotation. Finally, it was there that Jews and free men of color cooperated in the creation of Haiti, in 1804, “a new American nation with a racial identity all its own.”

The Jews in Dutch America

Jonathan I. Israel, the author of a recent and comprehensive survey of Dutch history, as well as several other groundbreaking works of socioeconomic and political history—among them, the most challenging account of the social role of European Jewry in the early modern age—opens the fifth section of this volume. His essay deals with the Jewish experience in Dutch America in its entirety, offering a panoramic view of the subject. Israel’s essay shows how Jews could flourish in the Caribbean colonies under Dutch rule, constructing a powerful trade network and engaging in the production of sugar cane and other colonial goods. While the Caribbean Jews gained an overwhelming economic weight in the eighteenth century, the Jews in Dutch Brazil—for the relatively short span of time during which Brazil was under Dutch control, before returning to the Portuguese flag—thrived in the 1630s and 1640s. This period, studied by Israel mainly from a socioeconomic perspective, appears to be extremely interesting if also approached from a religious and social point of view. Under Portuguese rule, New Christians could not legally and openly practice their Jewish faith, whereas during the brief though intense period of Dutch control over Brazil, New Christians had the possibility of reverting to open Judaism. Did they do so? How many made this choice? The subject is of particular interest because this
kind of sudden change of political rule is quite unique in Latin Ameri-
can history.

Israel’s essay is mainly concerned, however, with economic matters. It
depicts in great detail the differences between the two main Jewish
communities in the Dutch Caribbean, namely Curaçao—the “Amsterdam
of the Caribbean”—and Suriname, while offering also a brief sketch of
Barbados and Jamaican Jewry. Its conclusions are of the greatest signifi-
cance. In the first place, it appears clearly that in religious matters the
Dutch were far less tolerant in the colonies than at home. The flourishing
of Jewish trade was thus due more to a socioeconomic conjuncture than
to a peculiarly liberal toleration policy. Furthermore, with pertinence to
the Jews both in the brief Dutch-Brazilian period, and to the Caribbean
Jews under Dutch rule, Israel highlights the ways in which Jews in
“another environment” (to quote Robert Cohen) built a new kind of Jew-
ish society, based on economic activities—such as tropical agriculture—
quite different from any European model.

A closer analysis of the Jews in Dutch Suriname and Curaçao is pro-
vided by Wim Klooster, to whom we owe two outstanding recent publi-
cations on the colonial Dutch experience in the New World.21 Klooster’s
essay—based on a vast amount of archival materials—portrays in detail
the life of Jews in Suriname and Curaçao. The former constructed a
remarkably solid agricultural colony, based on sugar cane; the latter
instead developed, during the same period, a strong mercantile economy,
originally based on smuggling. The experience in Suriname contradicts
ipso facto the latent judeophobic assumption, commonly held in Europe
at that time, that Jews could not practice agriculture and did not like it. It
comes as no surprise that the Surinamese Jews sent a note of thanks to the
Prussian writer Christian Wilhelm von Dohm, who, as late as 1781, pub-
lished in Berlin a strong plea in favor of the betterment of the civil and
legal conditions of the Jews in Europe. In that work Dohm maintained
that the Jews could indeed be good farmers, as they were in biblical
times. The case of Suriname and Curaçao Jewry well demonstrates the
truth of all pro-Jewish literature from Simone Luzzatto in the early sev-
enteenth century to Henri Grégoire in the late eighteenth: if granted a cer-
tain degree of toleration and liberty, Jews could substantially contribute
to any kind of state economy. The staple market of Curaçao and the sugar
plantations of Suriname were a convenient outlet for investments from
Holland, when investment opportunities had decreased in the homeland.
Well into the eighteenth century, these two Dutch-Jewish colonies flour-
ished, starting to decline only in the last third of the eighteenth century
in conjunction with a major decline in the world (and especially Euro-
pean) economy. Those colonial societies offered a splendid testing
ground for daring businessmen and adventurers. Klooster’s essay closes
with a biographical sketch of one of these men (Felipe Henriquez,
1589–1656), who moved from marranism to international diplomacy,
from smuggling to high society.
James Homer Williams’s essay opens still another chapter in the history of the Jews in Dutch America. His perspective is comparative in its methodology and highly enlightening in its results. Williams takes into account side by side the development of the legal and social position of the Jews in Amsterdam and that of the Jews in New Amsterdam and Dutch Brazil. If compared to the situation in Amsterdam, the plight of the Jews in Brazil, and especially in New Amsterdam, appears to be far less happy. Especially in New Amsterdam the Jews faced a twofold hostility: on the one hand, they entered a market where Dutch merchants already held a prominent position; hence, there was no empty space for Jewish traders to conquer. At the same time, New Amsterdam’s governor Peter Stuyvesant was a fierce enemy of the Jews—whom he constantly defined as a “deceitful race”—along with all faiths other than the Reformed. After 1664, when New Amsterdam fell into British hands, and was renamed, faute de mieux, New York, things started to change, and the Jews began to enjoy a much more tolerant regime. Williams carefully describes the parallel evolution of British policy toward the Jews at home and in the colonies; as a result, it seems clear that in New York Jews enjoyed a toleration even more advanced than was the case in London.

A different economic situation—namely, a broader array of opportunities—was to be found by the Jews in Dutch Brazil. Williams underlines the different personality of Brazil’s governor, Johan Maurits, who was no less a Calvinist than Stuyvesant but far more oriented toward a pragmatic form of toleration. The West India Company encouraged Jewish migration to Brazil, where Jews could serve—as Williams describes it with a most acute definition—as “cultural brokers” with the Portuguese. The Calvinist zeal of Stuyvesant—at a time and in a city affected by a peculiar religious laxity that touched upon almost every faith and believer—prevented the Jews from blossoming in New Amsterdam. The moderate open-mindedness of Count Maurits, on the other hand, made Brazil a place where Jews were able to reach a remarkable degree of well-being. The “force of personality”—evoked here with the utmost opportunity by Williams, and a for a long time considered as a quantité négligeable by historiography—clearly played a major role in the two different destinies faced by the Jews in Brazil and New Amsterdam respectively.

The final essay of the “Dutch” section brings us a new and fresh perspective on Surinamese Jewry. Rachel Frankel offers here the fruits of her long-lasting, passionate involvement in the architectural history of “Jodensavanne,” the flourishing Jewish colony on the Suriname River. The essay shows all the potential of architectural history as a form of, inter alia, historical anthropology of space. The focus is on the synagogue and the cemetery of the Jodensavanne. Though the model remained that of Dutch religious and civic architecture, the Jodensavanne Jews, freed from any external pressure and free to confer on public and private spaces new meanings and functions, erected their own synagogue in 1685, ten years after the construction of the main Sephardic temple in
Amsterdam. The synagogue, ideally located at the very center of a very linear village, served as a symbol of faith and social cohesion.

The differences characterizing this building, internally and externally, in comparison with the Amsterdam model are full of meaning; they point toward a new appraisal both of the social significance of faith in Suriname and of the social structure of the community. Here, Jews were not only free, but also at the top of the social hierarchy. Though a minority, they constituted the ruling class. The population counted an overwhelming majority of black slaves, few whites, and some Ashkenazi and even black Jews, the latter newly converted to the faith of the elite. Jews found themselves for the first time in a situation of privilege, certainly not shared by their co-religionists in even the tolerant United Provinces. For the first time in the Jodensavanne, according to Frankel’s fascinating account, “Jews had the opportunity to design virgin landscape and construct it according to their needs, beliefs, and hopes.”

Frankel’s detailed description of Jodensavanne architecture provides a clear view of what this meant at a practical level. Of utmost interest also is the interaction—expressed even in architectural terms—between Jewish and African culture. There is evidence, such as in Paramaribo’s (the capital city of Suriname) Jewish cemetery, that the two different cultures and religions found points of contact, especially anthropologically, for they took place in the exceptionally symbolic terrain of death and remembrance. Frankel’s essay closes with an analysis of other important Surinamese synagogues, those of Paramaribo built in 1723 and 1735 respectively. Here, the space seems to lose, in its squared essentiality, all the messianic hopes and sense of freedom present in the Jodensavanne synagogue.

The Jewish Factor in the Atlantic Economy

The opening essay of this section, devoted to Jewish involvement in the Atlantic economy during the colonial era, is a definitive reassessment of the role played by Jews and New Christians in the Atlantic slave trade. This subject—which carries an enormous meaning not only at the historiographical, but also at the “ideological,” public opinion level—has been addressed by a leading specialist in the history of the British involvement in the slave trade, and in the history of slavery in general. Seymour Drescher22 provides a detailed analysis of the Jewish and New Christian participation in the Atlantic slave trade from the beginning until the late eighteenth century. His study takes into account not only purely economic factors, but also the ways in which those factors were interrelated with social background and legal distinctions using the classical division (in three phases) of the Atlantic slave trade: the first phase, from 1500 to 1640, during which a relatively minor number of black slaves were exported to the Americas; the second phase, from 1640 to 1700, which
saw the number of slaves forcibly embarked to the New World triple in number; and the final phase, between 1700 and the British abolition of 1807, when the number of slaves exported from Africa reached a peak (6,686,000, according to the most accurate estimate, outnumbering by far the sums in the forced migrations of the two previous phases).

Drescher demonstrates that only in the second phase did Jews play a major role in the trade, especially in the Dutch Caribbean colonies. As for the first phase, he concludes that “the only accounts of prominent Jewish presence in this initial process of oceanic exploration and trade are related to the scientific and cartographic experts mobilized by Prince Henry the Navigator to track his African exploratory expeditions.” The matter was different for the New Christians. They had a large share in the Iberian slave trade, which was never to be matched by that played by observant Jews, not even in the second phase of the Atlantic slave trade. According to Drescher, they could count on “trustworthy interlocking agents and trained apprentices,” vital in this kind of trade. Furthermore, in broader terms, “if their quasi-pariah religious status kept them at least once removed from institutional power, that same status tended to make them most effective in a world where opportunities for long-term credit were dependent upon kinship and trust.” Drescher also analyzes the function of the Jews in the French slave trade, identifying the Bordeaux Gradis family—an extremely interesting though rather unique case of extraordinary Jewish socioeconomic success—as one of the major slave traders in eighteenth-century France. In the last and massive phase of African slave traffic, however, the Jewish role was much constricted by the competition of other mercantile, often quasi-government, networks, and Jews clearly played a minor role in this trade.

On the other hand, Jews, and especially New Christians, played a very substantial part in a milder and less risky trade, that of sugar. James C. Boyajian, a leading authority on Portuguese economic history, particularly in its international dimension, offers a carefully documented picture of Jewish and New Christian involvement in the sugar trade from 1550 to 1750. The essay shows how and why Jews and New Christians achieved a prominence in this particular trade. The New Christians had developed a production-trade cycle, financing sugar cane production through the slave trade, but also through the trade of sugar itself.

At a certain point between 1650 and 1750, when sugar consumption lost its luxury character and became, along with other colonial products, a staple consumed massively in Europe, its producers reached the peak of wealth. Boyajian highlights the international dimension of New Christian trade in the American colonies, the ways and routes that linked the West and the East Indies, and the value of the import of Oriental luxury commodities, such as silk, which became fashionable not only in Europe, but also among the New Christian elites in the New World. In general, the commercial activities of the New Christians followed the ebb and flow of Atlantic trade throughout the early modern era. At a certain point,
with the possessions of Angola, Brazil, and Goa, the Portuguese could have—and indeed had—control over a large portion of international trade. It comes as no surprise that New Christians took advantage of this fortunate situation.

Ernst Pijning’s essay provides a close description of the New Christian sugar cultivators and traders in Brazil until ca. 1800. Here economic history is fruitfully intertwined with social and religious data. Pijning’s study, which includes a detailed survey of the terminology that identified the social layers in Portuguese Brazil, is revealing of the social plight and mobility of the New Christian elite of traders and planters. New Christians generally wanted to be seen as Old, in order to ascend the social ladder and integrate into the majority. This was true especially for the elites: a phenomenon that broadly mirrored what was happening in Europe between 1750 and 1900, when socially prominent Jews, in order to increase their prestige and enter public careers, converted to Christianity. New Christians, already more or less forcibly converted for generations, had on the contrary to demonstrate to the external world that they could be considered in toto as Old Christians.

Pijning offers a fascinating view, almost from within, of Portuguese colonial society. He demonstrates that the Inquisition acted with the concealed aim of attacking an upwardly mobile socioeconomic cluster and that religious dogmatism served as an external justification. He also shows that, in spite of legal restraints, New Christians surprisingly succeeded in acquiring public office, which was a means of protecting themselves from the Inquisition and securing a firm place in the social hierarchy. Finally, it is of particular interest to learn that sugar cultivation, although less economically rewarding, enabled cultivators to gain much more prestige than they could have obtained by engaging in trade, a situation that once more reflects, in the New World, a common European mentality deeply rooted in the European upper class well into the nineteenth century.

Closing this section of the book, Pieter Emmer’s study skillfully locates the “Jewish moment,” from 1580 to 1650, in a broad, world-history context of the two expansion systems in the Atlantic. Emmer, an authority on Dutch colonial and economic history, provides an international and comparative framework that enables us to understand the Jewish role in the Atlantic economy from a macro-historical perspective. His views, which could arouse vigorous debate among historians, help us to understand better the contents and general implications of what has been written by the other authors in the section. The essay displays in chronological detail the differences between the Iberian and the British-Dutch-French expansion systems, and the reasons that the Spanish economy never reached the prominence it could well have gained thanks to its immense possessions. It also shows why and how the Portuguese reached international prominence, which was later lost owing to the relative backwardness of their political and religious systems. Finally, the
essay deals with the felicitous momentum of the Dutch economy between 1600 and 1650, and with the emergence of the British to international prominence in the late seventeenth and particularly in the eighteenth centuries. The role the Jews played in those macro-systems was dependent upon, and subordinate to, the trends of development and decline of those systems themselves. Rather than determining them, the Jews were, as individual economic agents, almost completely conditioned by them. The Jews, normally very flexible, could not adapt, however, to the new, global economic international system that emerged in the eighteenth century. In their capacity of economic actors, as were the Genoese, the British, the Germans, and so on, the Jews were affected by historical ebbs and flows. Their economic importance occasionally reached the highest peaks; occasionally, also, the global economic momentum was unfavorable to them: as in England before the expulsion of 1290, or during the Genoese prominence in world trade until 1600, or, to cite but another example, in Germany before and during the Weimar Republic. It is against this background of world history that the Jewish (and New Christian) socioeconomic factor must be located and understood.

The Jews in Colonial British America

The final section of this book contains a single essay. The research that has been done on the Jews in colonial British America is—relative to the actual number of Jews living in North America before 1800—immense. No more than two thousand were in North America before 1800, a figure comparable to the Jews living in the Italian Ghetto of Mantua alone at the same time. From Salo Wittmayer Baron to Jacob Rader Marcus, scholars of Jewish history have offered multiple accounts of this subject. They have dug out from archives and other repositories a huge number of documents, and published some of them. The flood of publications on the subject seems unlimited, and even major scholars normally more engaged with other subjects, such as Arthur Hertzberg, have devoted volumes to the Jewish experience in Anglo-America before and after the birth of the United States.

Still, as is always the case in historiography, a much plowed field has not, for that reason alone, to be deserted. The Jews in North America were far from isolated, and the vertical line of their trade to Central and South America, often involving New Christian partners, for instance, is fascinating, although not comparable, in scope, to the Atlantic “horizontal” routes.

It is a matter of pride to conclude this volume with an essay by Jonathan D. Sarna. His commitment to, and his knowledge of, American-Jewish history, from the colonial time to the present, is unsurpassed. Sarna’s research encompasses a wide variety of aspects of this history, from the relationship with Israel to single case studies, such as Jewish communities (Cincinnati, Boston) and Jewish personalities. They are too
numerous to quote in a single footnote. His constant effort to overcome a parochial approach to Jewish history has become a model for scholarship. Attention to the interactions among cultures—and not only between a majority and a minority (concepts themselves particularly risky in the American “melting pot”)—is heuristically and methodologically the most rewarding way not only to approach Jewish history but also to understand other histories, other stories.

Sarna’s essay leads us back to the religious dimension of the Jewish experience in colonial America, that is to say, to the core of Judaism, for it can be argued that Judaism is first and foremost religion, faith—much more than the “ethnic” or “racial” or later “national” character, insofar as these factors can ever be separated from “religion.” It is traditional religious observance that explains the unique bond of the people of Israel (at least from the Middle Ages, if not from 70 A.D.) that Sarna painstakingly traces, the peculiarities of North American colonial Judaism, and the multiple ways in which it “was becoming increasingly distinctive from its European counterpart.” Jewish religion had to confront a new environment and a new society, and at the same time, the first Jews who migrated to the New World in the seventeenth century aimed at preserving Judaism, in its religious and messianic dimension, against the potential threat of this new, wild, and untamed environment. This was also true of the spiritual leaders of every religious minority that migrated to the New World. Thus, the leaders of the Jewish communities acted more in the religious than in the social and legal spheres. They did not maintain the overwhelming power of the European *kahal*, the communal organization that served as a guild, dominating every aspect of the life of families as well as individuals. Because of this difference in America, the violent confrontations between single individuals and Jewish communal authority, which we find in eighteenth-century Euro-Jewish history, did not take place in the Western Hemisphere.

Nothing comparable to a Jewish “state within the state” took root on American soil. Before and especially after the American Revolution, American Jewry tended to rely on the laws of the secular state for every aspect of their social life, whereas religion itself became an intimate way to preserve tradition and to adore God. Still, as Sarna brilliantly demonstrates, there were tensions between the “demands of Jewish law and the norms of the larger secular or Christian society in which Jews moved.” “Religious laxity” was also very frequent. “Diversity” was a peculiar mark of distinction in American religious life in a more radical way than was the case in Europe, at least for the same period: “Within every community, even within many individual families, a full gamut of religious observances and attitudes could be found, a spectrum ranging all the way from deep piety to total indifference.” At the same time, American colonial Jews—probably, but not necessarily, because of this phenomenon—“felt more comfortable interacting with Christians than Jews did in most parts of the world.” Intermarriage between Jews and Christians—
a phenomenon not infrequent in Europe, but which required preliminary conversion to Christianity of the Jewish partner—was impressively recurrent, for 10 to 15 percent of all Jewish marriages in the colonial period were intermarriages, a figure not found anywhere else in the Jewish world.

A Milder Colonization

Jews and New Christians came to America along with all the other “nations,” at the very beginning of the colonization. Contrary to the other nations—Spain, Portugal, France, Holland, Britain—they had no fleet or army, no West India Company or major public support, for they had no state of their own. In some of its peculiar traits their colonization of the New World followed the main character of every national colonization. Yet the fact that they did not have a nation-state at home fostered in them the desire to settle if not in their own state at least in a free country that could eventually become a secure haven to protect their faith and existence. This is precisely what happened in North America. In South America, after the revolutions of the nineteenth century, freedom of conscience was allowed, but anti-Semitism was and is still present to a degree unknown in North America. Jews came to America full of hope. Menasseh ben Israel’s messianic and political work, *Hope of Israel*, which helped bring about the readmission of the Jews in Britain, also became (though without probably any direct or implicit reference to that work) the name of two important early synagogues in two major centers of American Judaism, Curacao and Philadelphia. It is in the hope that this volume will help bring about better understanding and offer valuable insight into American Judaism—in its multiple interactions with Europe and the rest of the world—that I would like to close this introduction and invite the reader to approach the text.
Notes

1. This essay is dedicated to the memory of Antonello Gerbi and Giuliano Gliozzi. It was completed during my stay at The Institute for Advanced Study (Princeton) as a Member of the School of Historical Studies in the academic year 1998–1999.
Conflicts of Empires: Spain, the Low Countries and the Struggle for World Supremacy 1585–1713 (London, 1997).


